Accepting market returns: Risky business for defined contribution plans?

THE CHALLENGES IN MAKING WORKERS “RETIREMENT READY” ARE WELL KNOWN. Expectations of low future capital-market returns, together with longer lifespans and single-digit employee contribution rates, mean that many defined contribution (DC) plan participants face significant retirement savings shortfalls.

Aside from having employees work longer and defer retirement, the two levers employers can pull to address this situation are to encourage participants to save more and to offer investment solutions with the potential for higher returns and better downside mitigation. Both avenues for improving retirement outcomes could be impactful and should be explored; this piece focuses on the second path.

Will market returns get your participants from here to there?

We recently examined the forecasts of eight major investment consultants for capital market returns over a five- to 10-year time frame. Averaging those forecasts resulted in a prediction of 7.0% and 2.9% annual returns from global equities and core bonds, respectively.1

For a hypothetical 60% equity/40% bond portfolio, these numbers translate into an overall 5.4% expected annual return. Under a simple wealth-accumulation scenario (Figure 1, next page), using that 5.4% expected figure versus a reasonable 7.0% long-term historical average return reduces forecasted income from 70.2% of preretirement income to a scant 48.6%.

• Available estimates for each asset class were averaged after removing the highest and lowest estimates. | Data as of August 2016 collected by Wellington Management
Assumes a starting salary of $26,078 at age 23. The real income growth rate is constant at 5.5% from age 23 to age 30, and linearly declines to 3.5% at age 40, 1.0% at age 50, and 0% at age 60, and stays at 0% from age 60 to age 65. Based on these growth-rate assumptions and starting income of $26,078, real income is $79,420 at age 65 in the model. Sources: US Census, Wellington Management calculations | Total annual contribution rate starts at 8.9% at age 23, and gradually increases to 9.9% at age 27, 10.8% at age 32, 11.4% at age 37, 11.9% at age 42, 12.5% at age 47, 13.9% at age 52, 14.7% at age 57, 15.3% at age 62, and 15.7% at age 65. Savings include employee deferral and employer match. Expected income-replacement ratio at age 65 is calculated based on the assumption of 4% withdrawal rate. Sources: US Census, Fidelity Investments, Wellington Management. | The returns and other assumptions provided are hypothetical and are not representative of actual accounts or investments. This material is for illustrative purposes only, is not representative of future returns, and is not to be considered investment advice. Hypothetical results are not necessarily indicative of future results and an investment can lose value.

**Bridging the retirement-readiness gap**

We believe that plan sponsors can take meaningful strides toward addressing the income-replacement deficit by partnering with participants in efforts to increase savings rates and seek modestly higher returns. In our hypothetical scenario, adding 0.75% to market returns through active management would raise the income-replacement ratio to 57.6%; when combined with a 3% increase in the share of income contributed, the ratio moves up to 72.3% — a meaningful improvement (Figure 2).

**Active management: A vital tool**

In recent years, the low fees of index-tracking passive investment strategies have attracted a great deal of attention from plan sponsors. Getting the most value from each fee dollar spent is certainly in participants’ best interest. But to quote Warren Buffett, “Price is what you pay, value is what you get,” and minimizing fees is not necessarily the same as maximizing value. In fact, sponsors’ reliance on market returns to help their participants achieve retirement security could be perceived as inadequate. We believe the thoughtful use of active risk is essential to achieving successful participant outcomes in light of slim future expected market returns. In our view, the right question is not “active or passive?” Rather, it is “Where active and where passive?”
We believe the thoughtful use of active risk is essential to achieving successful participant outcomes in light of slim future expected market returns.

Why are we bullish on active management?

Adding alpha may be more risk-efficient than shifting asset allocations as a way to enhance potential return

Alpha tends to be more risk-efficient than beta. For example, an investor might consider adding more exposure to equities in a quest to improve returns. Yet based on the return assumptions cited earlier in this piece, adding 1% of expected market return (beta) would require boosting the portfolio’s equity allocation by about 14%. Said differently, 1% of alpha, which we would contend is not an outlandish goal, could potentially add as much return as an additional 14% in a passive equity beta allocation — a sizeable increase that could substantially heighten overall portfolio volatility and drawdown risk. We’d argue that adding 1% of active return (alpha) — a source of return independent of market direction — would increase overall portfolio risk much less than altering the stock/bond mix.

Extended valuations and mature bull markets highlight the importance of downside mitigation

Active management offers the potential to mitigate the impact of market downturns on portfolios. Mathematically, a dollar of alpha in a down market is worth more than a dollar of alpha in an up market. This idea is explored in a recent white paper from our Investment Strategy and Risk team.

Mean reversion favors active

As noted by one of our strategists in another paper, “Many active managers have underperformed in recent years, and active management has historically demonstrated some mean-reversion characteristics. What’s more, the volume of assets that has flowed into passive or other index-like approaches means there is less capital chasing active management opportunities, potentially providing more scope for active managers to add value.”

Alpha is getting cheaper

Further bolstering the appeal of actively managed investment approaches is the steady decline in their average fees. As active fees have compressed, we believe that one of the arguments for passive management is eroding. Many sponsors continue to focus on the low absolute level of passive fees, rather than on the cost differential (spread) between passive and active. This spread has shrunk significantly, to the point that we believe discussions about active and passive can now focus on the fundamental merits of the two approaches, rather than fee differentials, in achieving successful participant outcomes.

Summing up

Defined contribution plans have become the primary savings vehicle for millions of US workers, and participants are facing increased headwinds. As co-fiduciaries, we believe managers, consultants, and plan sponsors have a shared responsibility to seek out opportunities to maximize value and improve participant outcomes. While there is no silver bullet, the thoughtful use of active risk is a tool for reaching these goals that should be considered — if not embraced.
WELLINGTON MANAGEMENT COMPANY LLP  Boston | Chicago | Radnor, PA | San Francisco
WELLINGTON MANAGEMENT AUSTRALIA PTY LTD  Sydney
WELLINGTON MANAGEMENT CANADA LLC  Serviced from Boston and Chicago
WELLINGTON MANAGEMENT HONG KONG LTD  Hong Kong | Beijing Representative Office
WELLINGTON MANAGEMENT INTERNATIONAL LTD  London | Frankfurt
WELLINGTON MANAGEMENT JAPAN PTE LTD  Tokyo
WELLINGTON MANAGEMENT SINGAPORE PTE LTD  Singapore
WELLINGTON MANAGEMENT SWITZERLAND GmbH  Zurich
WELLINGTON LUXEMBOURG S.à r.l.  Luxembourg

www.wellington.com

Wellington Management Company LLP (WMC) is an independently owned investment adviser registered with the US Securities and Exchange Commission (SEC). WMC is also a commodity trading advisor (CTA) registered with the US Commodity Futures Trading Commission. In certain circumstances, WMC provides commodity trading advice to clients in reliance on exemptions from CTA registration. In the US for ERISA clients, WMC is providing this material solely for sales and marketing purposes and not as an investment advice fiduciary under ERISA or the Internal Revenue Code. WMC has a financial interest in offering its products and services and is not committing to provide impartial investment advice or give advice in a fiduciary capacity in connection with those sales and marketing activities. WMC, along with its affiliates (collectively, Wellington Management), provides investment management and investment advisory services to institutions around the world. Located in Boston, Massachusetts, Wellington Management also has offices in Chicago, Illinois; Radnor, Pennsylvania; San Francisco, California; Beijing; Frankfurt; Hong Kong; London; Luxembourg; Singapore; Sydney; Tokyo; and Zurich. This material is prepared for, and authorized for internal use by, designated institutional and professional investors and their consultants or for such other use as may be authorized by Wellington Management. This material and/or its contents are current at the time of writing and may not be reproduced or distributed in whole or in part, for any purpose, without the express written consent of Wellington Management. This material is not intended to constitute investment advice or an offer to sell, or the solicitation of an offer to purchase shares or other securities. Investors should always obtain and read an up-to-date investment services description or prospectus before deciding whether to appoint an investment manager or to invest in a fund. Any views expressed herein are those of the author(s), are based on available information, and are subject to change without notice. Individual portfolio management teams may hold different views and may make different investment decisions for different clients.

In Canada, this material is provided by Wellington Management Canada LLC, a US SEC-registered investment adviser also registered in the provinces of Alberta, British Columbia, Manitoba, New Brunswick, Newfoundland and Labrador, Nova Scotia, Ontario, Prince Edward Island, Quebec, and Saskatchewan in the categories of Portfolio Manager and Exempt Market Dealer. In the UK, this material is provided by Wellington Management International Limited (WMIL), a firm authorized and regulated by the Financial Conduct Authority (FCA). This material is directed only at persons (Relevant Persons) who are classified as eligible counterparties or professional clients under the rules of the FCA. This material must not be acted on or relied on by persons who are not Relevant Persons. Any investment or investment service to which this material relates is available only to Relevant Persons and will be engaged in only with Relevant Persons. In Germany, this material is provided by Wellington Management International Limited, Niederlassung Deutschland, the German branch of WML, which is authorized and regulated by the FCA and in respect of certain aspects of its activities by the Bundesanstalt für Finanzdienstleistungsaufsicht (BaFin). This material is directed only at persons (Relevant Persons) who are classified as eligible counterparties or professional clients under the German Securities Trading Act. This material does not constitute investment advice, a solicitation to invest in financial instruments or financial analysis within the meaning of Section 34b of the German Securities Trading Act. It does not meet all legal requirements designed to guarantee the independence of financial analyses and is not subject to any prohibition on dealing ahead of the publication of financial analyses. This material does not constitute a prospectus for the purposes of the German Capital Investment Code, the German Securities Sales Prospectus Act or the German Securities Prospectus Act. In Hong Kong, this material is provided to you by Wellington Management Hong Kong Limited (WM Hong Kong), a corporation licensed by the Securities and Futures Commission to conduct Type 1 (dealing in securities), Type 2 (dealing in futures contracts), Type 4 (advising on securities), and Type 9 (asset management) regulated activities, on the basis that you are a Professional Investor as defined in the Securities and Futures Ordinance. By accepting this material you acknowledge and agree that this material is provided for your use only and that you will not distribute or otherwise make this material available to any person. In Singapore, this material is provided for your use only by Wellington Management Singapore Pte Ltd (WM Singapore) (Registration Number 201615344E). WM Singapore is regulated by the Monetary Authority of Singapore under a Capital Markets Services Licence to conduct fund management activities and is an exempt financial adviser. By accepting this material you represent that you are a non-retail investor and that you will not copy, distribute or otherwise make this material available to any person. In Australia, Wellington Management Australia Pty Ltd (WM Australia) (ABN 19 167 091 090) has authorized the issue of this material for use solely by wholesale clients (as defined in the Corporations Act 2001). By accepting this material, you acknowledge and agree that this material is provided for your use only and that you will not distribute or otherwise make this material available to any person. Wellington Management Company LLP is exempt from the requirement to hold an Australian financial services licence (AFSL) under the Corporations Act 2001 in respect of financial services. A registered investment adviser regulated by the SEC, among others, is exempt from the need to hold an AFSL for financial services provided to Australian wholesale clients on certain conditions. Financial services provided by Wellington Management Company LLP are regulated by the SEC under the laws and regulatory requirements of the United States, which are different from the laws applying in Australia. In Japan, Wellington Management Japan Pte Ltd (WM Japan) (Registration Number 199504987R) has been registered as a Financial Instruments Firm with registered number: Director General of Kanto Local Finance Bureau (Kim-Sho) Number 428. WM Japan is a member of the Japan Investment Advisers Association (JIAA) and the Investment Trusts Association, Japan (ITA). WMIL, WM Hong Kong, WM Japan, and WM Singapore are also registered as investment advisers with the SEC; however, they will comply with the substantive provisions of the US Investment Advisers Act only with respect to their US clients.

©2017 Wellington Management Company LLP. All rights reserved.