# Pennsylvania Public School Employees' Retirement System 

Five-Year Experience Review Prepared as of June 30, 2015

June 10, 2016
xerox $0^{\circ}$

## Disclosures

The information contained herein is developed for the Board of Trustees and Staff of PSERS by Buck Consultants, LLC using generally accepted actuarial principles and techniques in accordance with all applicable Actuarial Standards of Practice (ASOPs). The presentation contains key results of the June 30, 2015 five-year experience study. All recommendations contained in this report are consistent with each other, as appropriate.

The material contained herein is based on member and financial data, actuarial assumptions and methods, and plan provisions applicable for the June 30, 2015 experience investigation of the Pennsylvania Public School Employees' Retirement System.

Where presented, references to "funded ratio" and "unfunded accrued liability" are measured on an actuarial value of assets basis. It should be noted that the same measurements using market value of assets would result in reduced funded ratios and increased unfunded accrued liabilities. Moreover, the funded ratio is appropriate for evaluating the need and level of future contributions but makes no assessment regarding the funded status of the plan were a settlement being considered.

No third party recipient of Buck's work product should rely upon Buck's work product absent involvement of Buck or without our approval.

Future actuarial measurements may differ significantly from current measurements due to plan experience differing from that anticipated by the economic and demographic assumptions, increases or decreases expected as part of the natural operation of the methodology used for these measurements, and changes in plan provisions or applicable law. An analysis of the potential range of future results is beyond the scope of this study.

David L. Driscoll is a Fellow of the Society of Actuaries and a Member of the American Academy of Actuaries. Edward Quinn and Salvador Nakar are Members of the American Academy of Actuaries. We meet the Qualification Standards of the American Academy of Actuaries to render the actuarial opinions contained herein. We are available to answer any questions on the material contained herein, or to provide explanations or further details as may be appropriate.

## Experience Review

- Experience review results based on 5 years of data

Act 120 created two new classes of PSERS active members, T-E and T-F:

- Employees who become members of PSERS on or after July 1, 2011 are automatically enrolled as Class T-E members
- $\quad$ Class T-E members may elect membership into Class T-F within 45 days of enrollment
- Actuarial valuations currently apply the same demographic assumptions used for legacy Classes T-C and T-D to Classes T-E and T-F.
- As of the June 30, 2015 actuarial valuation, there were 41,189 Class T-E members with average service of 1.3 years and 7,280 Class T-F members with average service of 1.7 years.
- As of June 30, 2015, there is insufficient Class T-E and Class T-F data accumulated to develop demographic assumptions solely for Class T-E and Class T-F active members.
- The experience for Class T-E and Class T-F members for non-vested withdrawal prior to 5 years of Service and Superannuation (age 65 with 3 years of service) have been combined with the experience of Class T-C and Class T-D members.
- $\quad$ The Class T-E and Class T-F experience will be reviewed when the next scheduled study is prepared as of June 30, 2020 and changes, if warranted, will be recommended at that time.


## Things That Happen to Members (Demographics Assumptions)

- KNOWN at valuation date:

1. Age
2. Gender
3. Service to date
4. Membership class

- ASSUMED at valuation date:

1. Retirement rate(s)
2. Death rates before and after retirement
3. Disability rates
4. Other termination rates


## Things That Happen to Members - Salary Increases (Economic Assumptions)

- KNOWN at valuation date:

| Salary History |  |
| :---: | ---: |
| Age 45 | $\$ 38,954$ |
| Age 46 | 40,999 |
| Age 47 | 43,069 |
| Total | $\$ 123,022$ |
| Current 3-Year FAS |  |
| $\$ 123,022 / 3=\$ 41,007$ |  |

- ASSUMED at valuation date:

| at Retirement |  |
| :---: | ---: |
| Age 57 | $\$ 64,799$ |
| Age 58 | 67,228 |
| Age 59 | 69,750 |
| Total | $\$ 201,777$ |
| Projected 3-Year FAS |  |
| $\$ 201,777 / 3=\$ 67,259$ |  |

## Things That Happen to Money (Economic Assumptions)

- KNOWN at valuation date:

1. Market value of System assets
2. Composition of System assets

- Stocks
- Bonds
- Short term
- Long term
- International
- Real estate
- Alternative investments
- ASSUMED at valuation date:

1. Future rates of investment return
2. Future rates of inflation

## Selection of Assumptions*

## What Assumption

Economic:

- Investment return
- Inflation


## Who Recommends to the Board

- PSERS staff, Investment Consultant and Actuary
- PSERS staff and Actuary
- PSERS staff and Actuary
- Optional forms of payment elections
- Actuary
- Retirement
- Disability
- Withdrawal
- Mortality
* Recent revisions to the ASOPs require the actuary to evaluate assumptions adopted by the Board for reasonableness unless the actuary feels he/she cannot make such an evaluation (which conclusion must be disclosed). Silence on assumptions is taken to indicate their acceptance as reasonable by the actuary.


## Actuarial Assumptions - Demographic

- Death After Retirement
- Death in Active Service
- Disability with at least 5 years
- Withdrawal
- Members enrolled prior to enactment of Act 120 (Classes T-C and T-D)
- Non-Vested with less than 5 years
- Vested with at least 5 years but less than 10 years
- Vested with at least 10 years
- Members enrolled after enactment of Act 120 (Classes T-E and T-F)
- Non-Vested with less than 5 years
- Non-Vested with at least 5 years but less than 10 years
- Vested with at least 10 years
- Early Retirement
- Age 55 with 25 Years
- Superannuation Retirement
- Members enrolled prior to enactment of Act 120 (Classes T-C and T-D)
- Age 62
- Age 60 with 30 years
- 35 years
- Members enrolled after enactment of Act 120 (Classes T-E and T-F)
- Age 65 with 3 years
- Any combination of age and service that totals 92 with at least 35 years of service
- Optional forms of payment elections - Refund of accumulated deductions at retirement and/or form of payment elected by member.


## Actuarial Assumptions - Economic

Current Assumptions

- Rate of Return - 7.50\%
- Components:
- Inflation - 3.00\%
- Real Rate of Return - 4.50\%
- Annual Salary Increase - 5.50\% (Effective Average)
- Components:
- Inflation-3.00\%
- Real Wage Growth \& Career Scale - 2.50\%
-PSERS Assumptions Shown in Table 12 of Valuation Report


## Setting Demographic Assumptions

- Based on 5-year Experience Review
- Full review covers July 1, 2010 - June 30, 2015
- Compare past experience ("actual") with assumptions ("expected")
- Determine trends
- Make judgments about future


## Setting Demographic Assumptions

- The expected number of separations from service on account of withdrawal, death, disability and service retirement is calculated by multiplying the rates of separation used as a basis for the active service tables by the number of those exposed to risk.
- The actual number of those who had separated from service is then compared with the expected number.
- If the ratio of actual to expected is $100 \%$, the table has exactly predicted what actually occurred. If the ratio of actual to expected is greater than 100\%, then the table has underestimated actual experience. If the ratio is less than $100 \%$, then the table has overstated actual experience.
- The ideal adjustment to the current non-mortality related rates is to produce an expected number that falls between the current expected number caused by the assumption and the actual number of separations.
- For mortality related separations, mortality trends among the general population are examined in combination with the relationship of current expected deaths versus the actual number of deaths.
- In general, mortality has continually been improving over the last decade and is expected to improve in the future.
- ASOP No. 35 states that the actuary should "include an assumption as to expected mortality improvement after the measurement date."


## Actuarial Cost Methods

- Cost method: Entry age normal
- Required by PSERS Code
- Actuarial asset valuation method: 10-year moving average
- Required by PSERS Code


## Post-Retirement Mortality

## Number of Deaths Males

| Type of Retirement | Actual | Expected |  | Actual $\div$ Expected |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Current | Proposed | Current | Proposed |
| Age \& Service | 9,026 | 8,408 | 9,124 | 107\% | 99\% |
| Disability | 411 | 414 | 380 | 99\% | 108\% |
|  | Number of Deaths Females |  |  |  |  |
| Type of |  | Expected |  | Actual $\div$ Expected |  |
| Retirement | Actual | Current | Proposed | Current | Proposed |
| Age \& Service | 16,437 | 15,053 | 16,489 | 109\% | 100\% |
| Disability | 685 | 660 | 683 | 104\% | 100\% |

## Post-Retirement Mortality

- Mortality has continually been improving over the last decade
- Mortality expected to improve in the future
- ASOP No. 35 states that the actuary should "include an assumption as to expected mortality improvement after the measurement date."
- PSERS is large enough to generate statistically credible mortality experience. This enables Buck to adjust the probabilities found in a standard table to reflect the experience of the System, where necessary.
- Recommendations
- Update the male annuitant mortality table to the RP-2014 male mortality table adjusted backward to 2006 with the MP-2014 mortality improvement scale and projected to the valuation date with the Buck Modified 2015 projection scale. This base mortality table will then be projected on a generational basis using the Buck Modified 2015 projection scale from the valuation date.
- Update the female annuitant mortality table to the RP-2014 female mortality table adjusted backward to 2006 with the MP-2014 mortality improvement scale, projected to 2013 with the Buck Modified 2015 projection scale and adjusted by, approximately, $93 \%$ for credibility. This base mortality table will then be projected on a generational basis using the Buck Modified 2015 projection scale to the valuation date and further projected using the Buck Modified 2015 projection scale.
- Update the male and female disabled annuitant mortality tables to the RP-2014 disabled mortality tables adjusted backward to 2006 with the MP-2014 mortality improvement scale and projected to the valuation date with the Buck Modified 2015 projection scale. These base mortality tables will then be projected on a generational basis using the Buck Modified 2015 projection scale from the valuation date.
- The recommended assumptions are appropriate for purposes of the valuation and are reasonably related to the experience of the System and to reasonable long-term expectations.
- The recommended assumptions are in compliance with ASOP No. 35.


## Post-Retirement Life Expectancy

|  | Current |  | Proposed |  | Increase |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Age | Male | Female | Male | Female | Male | Female |
| 60 | 24.4 | 27.1 | 23.9 | 26.6 | (0.5) | (0.5) |
| 65 | 20.0 | 22.6 | 19.8 | 22.3 | (0.2) | (0.3) |
| Current: | RP-2000 Combined Healthy Male Table set back 3 years RP-2000 Combined Healthy Female Table set back 3 years |  |  |  |  |  |
| Proposed: | Male annuitants: RP-2014 male mortality table adjusted backward to 2006 with the MP-2014 mortality improvement scale and projected to the 2015 valuation date with the Buck Modified 2015 projection scale. |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Female annuitants: RP-2014 female mortality table adjusted backward to 2006 with the MP-2014 mortality improvement scale, projected to 2013 with the Buck Modified 2015 projection scale and adjusted for credibility. This base mortality table will then be projected on a generational basis using the Buck Modified 2015 projection scale to the 2015 valuation date. |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | June 10, 2016 |  |  |  |  | IOX |

## Deaths in Active Service

## Number of Deaths - All Ages

| Sex | Expected |  |  |  | Actual $\div$ Expected |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Actual | Current | Proposed | Exposed | Current | Proposed |
| Males | 594 | 641 | 616 | 368,091 | 93\% | 96\% |
| Females | 820 | 860 | 860 | 976,252 | 95\% | 95\% |
| Total | 1,414 | 1,501 | 1,476 | 1,344,343 | 94\% | 96\% |

Current:

Proposed:

RP-2000 Employee Pre-retirement Mortality Tables. The Male table set back 3 years and the Female table set back 8 years.
Male annuitants: RP-2014 male employee mortality table adjusted backward to 2006 with the MP-2014 mortality improvement scale, projected to 2013 with the Buck Modified 2015 projection scale and adjusted by, approximately, 81\% for credibility.
Female annuitants: RP-2014 female employee mortality table adjusted backward to 2006 with the MP-2014 mortality improvement scale, projected to 2013 with the Buck Modified 2015 projection scale and adjusted by, approximately, 78\% for credibility.
These base mortality tables will then be projected on a generational basis using the Buck Modified 2015 projection scale to the valuation date and further projected using the Buck Modified 2015 projection scale.

## Disability Retirement - Male

|  |  | ith at Le Number | st 5 Years <br> Separatio | Service |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Average |  | Exp | cted |  | Actual | Expected |
| Age | Actual | Current | Proposed | Exposed | Current | Proposed |
| Under 33 | 6 | 10 | 8 | 27,639 | 60\% | 75\% |
| 35 | 6 | 37 | 21 | 36,472 | 16 | 29 |
| 40 | 20 | 68 | 44 | 40,050 | 29 | 46 |
| 45 | 56 | 72 | 64 | 37,668 | 78 | 88 |
| 50 | 108 | 105 | 107 | 36,718 | 103 | 101 |
| 55 | 185 | 175 | 180 | 40,719 | 106 | 103 |
| 60 | 151 | 150 | 151 | 31,345 | 101 | 100 |
| 65 | 14 | 19 | 17 | 12,409 | 74 | 82 |
| 70 | 10 | $\underline{5}$ | 10 | 7,389 | $\underline{200}$ | 100 |
| Total | 556 | 641 | 602 | 270,409 | 87\% | 92\% |

Recommendation: Decrease rates since the incidence of actual disability retirements is less than expected.

## Disability Retirement - Female

| With at Least 5 Years of Service <br> Number of Separations |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Average | Expected |  |  |  | Actual $\div$ Expected |  |
| Age | Actual | Current | Proposed | Exposed | Current | Proposed |
| Under 33 | 5 | 29 | 17 | 73,985 | 17\% | 29\% |
| 35 | 39 | 47 | 43 | 78,574 | 83 | 91 |
| 40 | 81 | 88 | 84 | 87,550 | 92 | 96 |
| 45 | 119 | 150 | 135 | 99,997 | 79 | 88 |
| 50 | 301 | 234 | 267 | 117,012 | 129 | 113 |
| 55 | 428 | 456 | 442 | 133,859 | 94 | 97 |
| 60 | 310 | 347 | 329 | 102,706 | 89 | 94 |
| 65 | 11 | 42 | 26 | 31,990 | 26 | 42 |
| 70 | 13 | 11 | 13 | 11,303 | 118 | 100 |
| Total | 1,307 | 1,404 | 1,356 | 736,976 | 93\% | 96\% |

Recommendation: Decrease rates, except for age 50, since the incidence of actual disability retirements is less than expected. Actual experience at age 50 is higher than expected, increase rates at age 50.

## Non-Vested Withdrawals - Male

## With Less Than 5 Years of Service

Number of Separations

| Average Age | Expected |  |  |  | Actual $\div$ Expected |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Actual | Current | Proposed | Exposed | Current | Proposed |
| 20 | 1,011 | 445 | 728 | 3,178 | 227\% | 139\% |
| 25 | 4,244 | 3,084 | 3,664 | 24,672 | 138 | 116 |
| 30 | 2,739 | 1,921 | 2,331 | 18,296 | 143 | 118 |
| 35 | 1,617 | 1,128 | 1,373 | 10,254 | 143 | 118 |
| 40 | 1,373 | 1,118 | 1,246 | 8,597 | 123 | 110 |
| 45 | 1,410 | 1,156 | 1,283 | 8,896 | 122 | 110 |
| 50 | 1,460 | 1,215 | 1,338 | 9,348 | 120 | 109 |
| 55 | 1,225 | 1,010 | 1,117 | 8,671 | 121 | 110 |
| 60 | 871 | 637 | 754 | 6,216 | 137 | 116 |
| Total | 15,950 | 11,714 | 13,834 | 98,128 | 136\% | 115\% |

Recommendation: Increase the rates since the total incidence of actual non-vested withdrawals is more than expected.

## Non-Vested Withdrawals - Female

## With Less Than 5 Years of Service

|  | Number of Separations |  |  | Exposed | Actual $\div$ Expected |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Average | Expected |  |  |  |  |  |
| Age | Actual | Current | Proposed |  | Current | Proposed |
| 20 | 849 | 378 | 614 | 2,683 | 225\% | 138\% |
| 25 | 8,954 | 8,427 | 8,693 | 64,821 | 106 | 103 |
| 30 | 5,956 | 5,300 | 5,631 | 40,773 | 112 | 106 |
| 35 | 3,720 | 3,133 | 3,427 | 24,174 | 119 | 109 |
| 40 | 3,903 | 3,352 | 3,626 | 29,858 | 116 | 108 |
| 45 | 4,223 | 3,779 | 4,001 | 34,672 | 112 | 106 |
| 50 | 3,527 | 3,095 | 3,311 | 28,393 | 114 | 107 |
| 55 | 2,431 | 2,104 | 2,268 | 19,299 | 116 | 107 |
| 60 | 1,383 | 1,109 | 1,246 | 10,171 | 125 | 111 |
| Total | 34,946 | 30,677 | 32,817 | 254,844 | 114\% | 106\% |

Recommendation: Increase the rates since the total incidence of actual non-vested withdrawals is more than expected.

## Vested Withdrawals

Terminations With 5 or More Years of Service but Before Age 55 with 25 Years of Service and

Before Eligible for Superannuation Can Elect Immediate Retirement with an Actuarial Reduction or Deferred Retirement

- Currently, we apply one set of assumed probabilities to members with less than 10 years of service, and a different set of assumed probabilities to members with at least 10 years of service
- Significant differences in withdrawal rates between the two service groups warrant continuation of separate assumption sets
- Class T-E and Class T-F members vest after 10 years of service.
- There is insufficient Class T-E and Class T-F data to establish withdrawal probabilities in the interval after 5 but before 10 years of service for these groups separately.
- Continue to apply the same probability used for Classes T-C and T-D to Classes T-E and T-F until enough experience data is accumulated to develop separate decrements for these classes. Will be reviewed in the next scheduled study.


## Vested Withdrawals - Male

With at Least 5 but Less Than 10 Years of Service Can Elect Immediate Retirement or Deferred Retirement


Recommendation: Actual withdrawals were higher than expected for all ages and we recommend increasing the rates.

## Vested Withdrawals - Female

With at Least 5 but Less Than 10 Years of Service Can Elect Immediate Retirement or Deferred Retirement

| AverageAge | Number of Separations |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Expected |  |  |  | Actual $\div$ Expected |  |
|  | Actual | Current | Proposed | Exposed | Current | Proposed |
| Under 28 | 344 | 455 | 400 | 5,348 | 76\% | 86\% |
| 30 | 3,560 | 4,136 | 3,849 | 63,628 | 86 | 92 |
| 35 | 2,023 | 2,000 | 2,011 | 36,362 | 101 | 101 |
| 40 | 1,352 | 1,162 | 1,257 | 25,812 | 116 | 108 |
| 45 | 1,597 | 1,273 | 1,435 | 31,813 | 125 | 111 |
| 50 | 1,812 | 1,328 | 1,569 | 35,414 | 136 | 115 |
| 55 | 1,319 | 988 | 1,153 | 26,333 | 134 | 114 |
| 60 | 942 | 570 | 757 | 12,672 | 165 | 124 |
| Total | 12,949 | 11,912 | 12,431 | 237,382 | 109\% | 104\% |

Recommendation: Actual withdrawals were less than expected for all ages up to age 30 and we recommend decreasing the rates at these ages. Actual withdrawals after age 30 were higher than expected and we recommend increasing the rates.

## Vested Withdrawals - Male

## With at Least 10 Years of Service <br> Can Elect Immediate Retirement or Deferred Retirement

Number of Separations

| Average Age | Expected |  |  |  | Actual $\div$ Expected |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Actual | Current | Proposed | Exposed | Current | Proposed |
| Under 33 | 49 | 31 | 40 | 1,565 | 158\% | 123\% |
| 35 | 293 | 299 | 299 | 19,948 | 98 | 98 |
| 40 | 435 | 382 | 410 | 30,754 | 114 | 106 |
| 45 | 456 | 381 | 417 | 30,474 | 120 | 109 |
| 50 | 629 | 498 | 563 | 29,317 | 126 | 112 |
| 55 | 680 | 543 | 612 | 22,939 | 125 | 111 |
| 60 | 896 | 608 | 752 | 11,609 | 147 | 119 |
| Total | 3,438 | 2,742 | 3,093 | 146,426 | 125\% | 111\% |

Recommendation: Actual total withdrawals were higher than expected for all ages, except age 35, and we recommend increasing the rate at these ages. Actual experience at age 35 is within an acceptable range and no change is recommended.

## Vested Withdrawals - Female

## With at Least 10 Years of Service <br> Can Elect Immediate Retirement or Deferred Retirement

Number of Separations

| Average Age | Expected |  |  |  | Actual $\div$ Expected |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Actual | Current | Proposed | Exposed | Current | Proposed |
| Under 33 | 126 | 125 | 125 | 3,121 | 101\% | 101\% |
| 35 | 1,101 | 1,226 | 1,165 | 40,874 | 90 | 95 |
| 40 | 1,009 | 887 | 946 | 59,133 | 114 | 107 |
| 45 | 1,151 | 959 | 1,054 | 63,908 | 120 | 109 |
| 50 | 1,820 | 1,349 | 1,588 | 77,077 | 135 | 115 |
| 55 | 2,607 | 2,424 | 2,515 | 83,370 | 108 | 104 |
| 60 | 3,834 | 2,889 | 3,361 | 49,612 | 133 | 114 |
| Total | 11,648 | 9,859 | 10,754 | 377,095 | 118\% | 108\% |

Recommendation: Actual total withdrawals were higher than expected, for all ages after age 35. We recommend an increase to the rates from age 40. Actual experience under age 33 is within an acceptable range and no change is recommended. Actual withdrawals at age 35 were lower than expected and we recommend decreasing the rate.

## Early Retirement - Male

Age 55 with at Least 25 Years Service, but
Not Eligible for Superannuation
Immediate Retirement with 3\% per annum Early Retirement Reduction from Superannuation
Number of Separations

| Average Age | Expected |  |  |  | Actual $\div$ Expected |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Actual | Current | Proposed | Exposed | Current | Proposed |
| 55 | 751 | 509 | 630 | 3,393 | 148\% | 119\% |
| 56 | 570 | 466 | 518 | 3,004 | 122 | 110 |
| 57 | 458 | 383 | 420 | 2,469 | 120 | 109 |
| 58 | 382 | 311 | 346 | 2,004 | 123 | 110 |
| 59 | 436 | 309 | 373 | 1,719 | 141 | 117 |
| 60 | 127 | 90 | 109 | 754 | 141 | 117 |
| 61 | $\underline{224}$ | 174 | 199 | $\underline{695}$ | 129 | 113 |
| Total | 2,948 | 2,242 | 2,595 | 14,038 | 131\% | 114\% |

Recommendation: Actual retirements were higher than expected for all ages and we recommend increasing the rates.

## Early Retirement - Female

Age 55 with at Least 25 Years Service, but Not Eligible for Superannuation
Immediate Retirement with 3\% per annum Early Retirement Reduction from Superannuation


Recommendation: Actual retirements were higher than expected for all ages and we recommend increasing the rates.

## Normal Retirement (Superannuation) - Male

Classes T-C \& T-D: Age 62, Age 60 with 30 Years, or 35 Years Classes T-E \& T-F: Age 65 with 3 Years

| Average Age | Number of Separations |  |  | Exposed | Actual $\div$ Expected |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Exp | ected |  |  |  |
|  | Actual | Current | Proposed |  | Current | Proposed |
| Under 53 | 2 | 4 | 3 | 15 | 50\% | 67\% |
| 55 | 397 | 352 | 375 | 1,205 | 113 | 106 |
| 60 | 2,989 | 2,825 | 2,907 | 9,703 | 106 | 103 |
| 65 | 3,387 | 2,974 | 3,180 | 15,289 | 114 | 107 |
| 68 | 334 | 291 | 312 | 1,615 | 115 | 107 |
| 69 | $\underline{288}$ | $\underline{250}$ | $\underline{269}$ | 1,391 | 115 | 107 |
| Subtotal under 70 | 7,397 | 6,696 | 7,046 | 29,218 | 110 | 105 |
| 70+ | 812 | 681 | 732 | 3,784 | 119 | 111 |
| Total All Ages | 8,209 | 7,377 | 7,778 | 33,002 | 111\% | 106\% |

Recommendation: Actual retirements after age 53 were higher than expected and we recommend an increase to the rates for these ages. Actual retirements prior to age 55 were less than expected and we recommend a decrease to these rates.

## Normal Retirement (Superannuation) - Female

Classes T-C \& T-D: Age 62, Age 60 with 30 Years, or 35 Years Classes T-E \& T-F: Age 65 with 3 Years

Number of Separations

| Average Age | Expected |  |  |  | Actual $\div$ Expected |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Actual | Current | Proposed | Exposed | Current | Proposed |
| Under 53 | 0 | 5 | 2 | 15 | 0\% | 0\% |
| 55 | 533 | 531 | 532 | 1,717 | 100 | 100 |
| 60 | 7,647 | 7,322 | 7,483 | 24,204 | 104 | 102 |
| 65 | 9,030 | 7,381 | 8,204 | 35,264 | 122 | 110 |
| 68 | 680 | 532 | 606 | 2,659 | 128 | 112 |
| 69 | 486 | 413 | 449 | 2,063 | 118 | 108 |
| Subtotal under 70 | 18,376 | 16,184 | 17,276 | 65,922 | 114\% | 106\% |
| 70+ | 1,186 | 1,040 | 1,133 | 5,201 | 114 | 105 |
| Total All Ages | 19,562 | 17,224 | 18,409 | 71,123 | 114\% | 106\% |

Recommendation: Actual retirements after age 53 were higher than expected and we recommend an increase to the rates for these ages. There were no actual retirements prior to age 55 and we recommend a decrease to these rates.

## Optional Forms of Benefit Payment at Retirement: Annuity Payments

- Members, upon retirement, may elect to receive the Maximum Single Life Annuity (MSLA), or one of the following annuity payment options that is actuarially equivalent to the MSLA:
- Option 1 - Guarantee of total payments equal to maximum single life annuity reserve
- Option 2-100\% Joint and Survivor annuity
- Option 3-50\% Joint and Survivor annuity
- Option 4 - Some other form of annuity payment that is actuarially equivalent to the MSLA (subject to the System's Code restrictions)
- The System's optional forms of payment factors are based on a 4\% interest rate.
- Presents a reduction in liability to the System's annual valuation which, currently, uses a $7.50 \%$ rate of investment return.
- During the examination period, the distribution of optional forms of annuity payment elected by retiring members were:
- 51.5\% elected MSLA
- $20.8 \%$ elected Option 1
- $18.8 \%$ elected Option 2
- 7.8\% elected Option 3
- 1.1\% elected Option 4


## Optional Forms of Benefit Payment at Retirement: Annuity Payments (continued)

- Current valuation assumption: Assume 100\% of all eligible retirements will elect the MSLA form of payment.
- Recommendation: Assume the following distribution of optional forms of annuity payment elections upon retirement from active status.
- $50 \%$ will elect MSLA
- $20 \%$ will elect Option 1
- $20 \%$ will elect Option 2 (assuming males are 3 years older than females)
- $10 \%$ will elect Option 3 (assuming males are 3 years older than females)
- $0 \%$ will elect Option 4


## Optional Forms of Benefit Payment at Retirement : Option 4 - Withdrawal of Accumulated Deductions at Retirement

- Classes T-C and T-D members may elect to receive a lump sum that is less than or equal to the member's Accumulated Deductions at retirement. In addition, the member receives a reduced annuity.
- The System's optional forms of payment factors are based on a 4\% interest rate.
- Presents an additional liability to the System's annual valuation which, currently, uses a $7.50 \%$ rate of investment return.
- Current valuation assumption: Assume 100\% of all eligible retirements will elect an Option 4 form of payment - withdrawing all accumulated deductions.
- Recommendation: Assume 80\% of all eligible retirements will elect an Option 4 form of payment withdrawing all accumulated deductions.
- PSERS staff communicated that in-house data shows:
- $87 \%$ of recent retirements elect to receive a partial or full withdrawal of the member's accumulated deductions.
- Approximately, $80 \%$ of recent retirements elect to withdraw $100 \%$ of the accumulated deductions.
- Annual valuation data provided to Buck:
- Does not contain information on withdrawal of accumulated deductions upon retirement.
- Retired data provides information on the balance of a member's accumulated deductions: 77\% of 2015 actuarial valuation retired member records report no remaining balance for the accumulated deductions.


## Cost Impact of Demographic Assumption Changes

| Item | June 30, 2015 Actuarial Valuation |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Unfunded Accrued Liability ${ }^{1}$ | Funded Ratio ${ }^{1}$ | Normal Cost Rate | Employer Pension Rate ${ }^{2}$ | Employer Pension Contribution ${ }^{23}$ |
| BEFORE CHANGES | \$37,336 Mil | 60.6\% | 8.31\% | 29.20\% | \$3,956 Mil |
| Demographic Assumptions |  |  |  |  |  |
| (1) Post-retirement mortality | 1,104 | (0.7) | . 21 | . 80 | 109 |
| (2) Death in-service | (15) | 0.0 | (.01) | (.02) | (2) |
| (3) Disability retirement | (1) | 0.0 | (.01) | (.01) | (1) |
| (4) Withdrawal prior to Retirement | 94 | (0.1) | (.16) | (.11) | (15) |
| (5) Retirement (Early, Superannuation and Late) | 623 | (0.4) | . 18 | . 51 | 69 |
| (6) Optional forms of benefit payment | (704) | 0.5 | (.26) | (.64) | (88) |
| TOTAL DEMOGRAPHIC CHANGES | \$1,101 Mil | (0.7)\% | .05\% | .53\% | \$72 Mil |
| AFTER REFLECTING CHANGES | \$38,437 Mil | 59.9\% | 8.26\% | 29.73\% | \$4,028 Mil |

1. Actuarial value of assets basis.
2. Without regard to the Act 120 pension collar.
3. Based on the fiscal year 2017 appropriation pay of $\$ 13,549,000,000$.

## Option Factor Presentation

Please refer to Buck's June 10, 2016 Update of Administrative Option Factors Presentation

## Economic Assumptions

Current Assumptions

- Rate of return
- $\quad 7.50 \%$
- Annual pay increase
5.50\%
(30-year career average for member hired at age 30)


## Setting Economic Assumptions

- Review past experience
- Review general practice
- Develop component parts of each assumption
- Maintain linkage with investments
- Maintain internal consistency
- Make judgment about future


## Interest Rate and Salary Increase

| Actual Past Experience |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Fiscal | Increase In CPI-U | Return on Market Value <br> of Assets ${ }^{1}$ | Individual Salary <br> Increases |
| $2010 / 2011$ | $3.6 \%$ | $20.40 \%$ | $4.9 \%$ |
| $2011 / 2012$ | 1.7 | 3.40 | 3.2 |
| $2012 / 2013$ | 1.8 | 8.00 | 3.5 |
| $2013 / 2014$ | 2.1 | 14.90 | 3.6 |
| $2014 / 2015$ | 0.1 | 3.00 | 3.7 |
| Average | $1.8 \%$ | $9.74 \%$ | $3.8 \%$ |
| Current Assumption | $3.00 \%$ | $7.50 \%$ | $5.50 \%$ |
| Conclusion |  |  |  |
| Proposal | Reconsider | Reconsider | High |
|  | $2.75 \%$ | $7.375 \%$ | $5.25 \%$ |
|  |  | $7.25 \%$ | $5.00 \%$ |
|  |  | $7.00 \%$ | $4.75 \%$ |

1. Provided by PSERS' investment consultant (Aon Hewitt for fiscal years 2013/2014 and 2014/2015 and Wilshire Associates for prior years).

## Salary Increase Rate

| Average Age | Actual Percentage Increase |  |  |  |  | Total | Assumption |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 2010/2011 | 2011/2012 | 2012/2013 | 2013/2014 | 2014/2015 |  | Current | Proposal 1* (Recommended) |
| 20 | 15.0\% | 13.1\% | 15.8\% | 18.0\% | 16.7\% | 15.6\% | 10.60\% | 10.10\% |
| 25 | 8.9 | 6.6 | 7.7 | 8.5 | 9.3 | 8.1 | 9.69 | 9.19 |
| 30 | 6.3 | 4.4 | 4.8 | 4.9 | 5.3 | 5.2 | 8.31 | 7.81 |
| 35 | 5.7 | 3.9 | 4.3 | 4.4 | 4.5 | 4.5 | 7.25 | 6.75 |
| 40 | 5.3 | 3.5 | 3.8 | 4.0 | 4.1 | 4.2 | 6.25 | 5.75 |
| 45 | 4.5 | 3.0 | 3.1 | 3.4 | 3.3 | 3.4 | 5.25 | 4.75 |
| 50 | 4.0 | 2.6 | 2.7 | 2.8 | 2.9 | 3.0 | 4.31 | 3.81 |
| 55 | 3.6 | 2.2 | 2.4 | 2.4 | 2.7 | 2.7 | 3.81 | 3.31 |
| 60 | 3.4 | 2.1 | 2.2 | 2.2 | 2.4 | 2.5 | 3.75 | 3.25 |
| 65 | 3.4 | 2.1 | 1.8 | 2.0 | 2.3 | 2.3 | 3.75 | 3.25 |
| 70+ | 3.4 | 2.1 | 1.8 | 1.7 | 2.2 | 2.3 | 3.75 | 3.25 |
| Total | 4.9\% | 3.2\% | 3.5\% | 3.6\% | 3.7\% | 3.8\% | 5.50\% | 5.00\% |

* Proposal 1: Averages to $0.50 \%$ less than Current.

Proposal 2: Averages to $0.25 \%$ less than Current.
Proposal 3: Averages to $0.75 \%$ less than Current with a minimum salary increase rate of $3.25 \%$

## Salary Increase Rate <br> (continued)

| Average Age | Historical Average Actual Salary Experience |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Five Year Average (2010-2015) | Ten Year Average (2005-2015) | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Fifteen Year } \\ & \text { Average } \\ & (2000-2015) \end{aligned}$ |
| 20 | 15.6\% | 16.6\% | 16.3\% |
| 25 | 8.1\% | 8.9\% | 9.1\% |
| 30 | 5.2\% | 6.2\% | 6.4\% |
| 35 | 4.5\% | 5.5\% | 5.7\% |
| 40 | 4.2\% | 4.9\% | 5.2\% |
| 45 | 3.4\% | 4.2\% | 4.5\% |
| 50 | 3.0\% | 3.7\% | 3.9\% |
| 55 | 2.7\% | 3.2\% | 3.4\% |
| 60 | 2.5\% | 3.0\% | 3.2\% |
| 65 | 2.3\% | 2.8\% | 3.0\% |
| 70+ | 2.3\% | 3.1\% | 3.1\% |
| Total | 3.8\% | 4.5\% | 4.7\% |

## Historical Rate of Investment Return Assumption

| June 30 Valuation | Rate of Investment Return <br> Assumption |
| :---: | :---: |
| Before 2008 | $8.50 \%$ |
| 2008 | $8.25 \%$ |
| $2009-2010$ | $8.00 \%$ |
| $2011-2015$ | $7.50 \%$ |
| 2016 | $7.25 \%$ |
|  | Recommended |

## Asset Return History

(1) Investment performance of the fund over the 25 year period ending June 30, 2015 is $8.45 \%{ }^{1}$
(2) Investment performance of the fund over the 30 year period ending June 30, 2015 is $8.98 \%{ }^{1}$

| Actual Past Experience -2000 to 2015 |  |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | Return on Assets |
| Fiscal Year | Market Value ${ }^{2}$ |
| $2000 / 2001$ | $(7.4) \%$ |
| $2001 / 2002$ | $(5.3)$ |
| $2002 / 2003$ | 2.7 |
| $2003 / 2004$ | 19.7 |
| $2004 / 2005$ | 12.9 |
| $2005 / 2006$ | 15.3 |
| $2006 / 2007$ | 22.9 |
| $2007 / 2008$ | $(2.8)$ |
| $2008 / 2009$ | $(26.5)$ |
| $2009 / 2010$ | 14.6 |
| $2010 / 2011$ | 20.4 |
| $2011 / 2012$ | 3.4 |
| $2012 / 2013$ | 8.0 |
| $2013 / 2014$ | 14.9 |
| $2014 / 2015$ | 3.0 |

1. Information from October 6, 2015 PSERS press release.
2. Provided by PSERS' investment consultant and as shown in the Annual Valuation Reports.

## Expected Long Term Rate of Return

Please refer to page 17 of Aon's June 10, 2016
Capital Market Assumptions Presentation for their 30 Year Expected
Return Forecast

Distribution of Systems and Rate of Investment Return Assumption Used for Valuation


Source: NASRA Public Pension Investment Brief, published February 2016

## Economic Assumption Components

- Interest Rate

|  | Current | Proposal 1 | Proposal 2 | Proposal 3 |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Inflation | $3.00 \%$ | $2.75 \%$ | $2.750 \%$ |
| $2.75 \%$ |  |  |  |  |
|  | Real Return | 4.50 | 4.50 | 4.625 |
|  | $7.50 \%$ | $7.25 \%$ | $7.375 \%$ | 7.25 |

- Salary Increase

| Inflation <br>  <br> Real Wage/Growth <br> Career Scale | Current | Proposal 1 | Proposal 2 | Proposal 3 |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |

## Change in Unfunded Accrued Liability ${ }^{1}$ due to Economic Assumption Changes Only ${ }^{2}$

| Average Annual <br> Salary Increase <br> Assumption | June 30, 2015 Actuarial Valuation <br> Interest Rate Assumption |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | $7.50 \%$ | $7.375 \%$ | $7.25 \%$ | $7.00 \%$ |
| $5.50 \%$ (current) | - | $\$ 1,223 \mathrm{Mil}$ | $\$ 2,445 \mathrm{Mil}$ | $\$ 5,019 \mathrm{Mil}$ |
| $5.25 \%$ | $\$(443) \mathrm{Mil}$ | $\$ 772$ | $\$ 1,987$ | $\$ 4,546$ |
| $5.00 \%$ | $\$(884)$ | $\$ 324$ | $\$ 1,531$ | $\$ 4,075$ |
| $4.75 \%$ | $\$(1,138)$ | $\$ 66$ |  |  |

1. Actuarial value of assets basis.
2. The amounts are in addition to the full cost impact of demographic assumption changes found on slide 33 .

## Change in Funded Ratios ${ }^{1}$ under the Various Economic Assumptions Only²

| Average Annual Salary <br> Increase Assumption | June 30, 2015 Actuarial Valuation <br> Interest Rate Assumption |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | $7.50 \%$ | $7.375 \%$ | $7.25 \%$ | $7.00 \%$ |
| $5.25 \%$ | - | $(0.8) \%$ | $(1.5) \%$ | $(3.0) \%$ |
| $5.00 \%$ | $0.3 \%$ | $(0.5) \%$ | $(1.2) \%$ | $(2.7) \%$ |
| $4.75 \%$ | $0.7 \%$ | $(0.2) \%$ | $(1.0) \%$ | $(2.5) \%$ |

1. Actuarial value of assets basis.
2. The amounts are in addition to the full cost impact of demographic assumption changes found on slide 33 .

## Change in Employer Pension Contribution Rates ${ }^{1}$ due to Economic Assumption Changes Only ${ }^{2}$

| Average Annual Salary Increase Assumption | June 30, 2015 Actuarial Valuation Interest Rate Assumption |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 7.50\% | 7.375\% | 7.25\% | 7.00\% |
| 5.50\% (current) |  |  |  |  |
| Normal Cost Rate |  | . $41 \%$ | .84\% | 1.73\% |
| Unfunded Liability Rate |  | . $41 \%$ | . $80 \%$ | 1.60\% |
| Employer Pension Rate |  | 0.82\% | 1.64\% | 3.33\% |
| 5.25\% |  |  |  |  |
| Normal Cost Rate | (.49)\% | (.09)\% | . $32 \%$ | 1.18\% |
| Unfunded Liability Rate | (.23)\% | . $18 \%$ | . $57 \%$ | 1.37\% |
| Employer Pension Rate | (.72)\% | .09\% | .89\% | 2.55\% |
| 5.00\% |  |  |  |  |
| Normal Cost Rate | (.97)\% | (.59)\% | (.19)\% | .64\% |
| Unfunded Liability Rate | (.47)\% | (.06)\% | . $33 \%$ | 1.13\% |
| Employer Pension Rate | (1.44)\% | (.65)\% | .14\% | 1.77\% |
| 4.75\% |  |  |  |  |
| Normal Cost Rate | (1.41)\% | (1.04)\% | (.66)\% | .14\% |
| Unfunded Liability Rate | (.60)\% | (.19)\% | . $20 \%$ | 1.00\% |
| Employer Pension Rate | (2.01)\% | (1.23)\% | (.46)\% | 1.14\% |

1. Without regard to the Act 120 pension collar. Also assumes current payroll growth assumption of $3.5 \%$.
2. The amounts are in addition to the full cost impact of demographic assumption changes found on slide 33 .

## Change in Employer Pension Contribution Amount ${ }^{1}$ due to Economic Assumption Changes Only²

| Average Annual <br> Salary Increase <br> Assumption | June 30, 2015 Actuarial Valuation <br> Interest Rate Assumption |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | $\mathbf{7 . 5 0 \%}$ | $\mathbf{7 . 3 7 5 \%}$ | $\mathbf{7 . 2 5 \%}$ |  |
| $5.50 \%$ (current) | - | $\$ 111 \mathrm{Mil}$ | $\$ 222 \mathrm{Mil}$ | $\mathbf{7 . 0 0 \%}$ |
| $5.25 \%$ | $\$(97) \mathrm{Mil}$ | $\$ 12$ | $\$ 121$ | $\$ 451 \mathrm{Mil}$ |
| $5.00 \%$ | $\$(195)$ | $\$(88)$ | $\$ 19$ | $\$ 346$ |
| $4.75 \%$ | $\$(272)$ | $\$(167)$ | $\$(62)$ | $\$ 155$ |

1. Without regard to the Act 120 pension collar. Also assumes current payroll growth assumption of $3.5 \%$.
2. The amounts are in addition to the full cost impact of demographic assumption changes found on slide 33 .

## Actuarial Cost Method

## Current Method

- Each annual actuarial valuation determines the employer contribution rate for the second succeeding fiscal year
- The June 30, 2015 valuation sets the contribution rate for fiscal 2016/2017
- One step in determining the employer rate is the calculation of an average normal contribution rate for all members active on the valuation date
- A normal contribution rate for each member is determined individually
- Calculate individual member normal contribution rates by determining a pay-weighted average normal contribution rate


## Actuarial Cost Method

## Recommendation

- Continue to calculate individual member normal contribution rates by determining a pay-weighted average normal contribution rate
$\rightarrow$ The cost method complies with the pension code.
- Complies with the requirements of GASB Statements 67 and 68.


## Recommended Assumptions

| Assumption | Recommendation |
| :--- | :---: |
| Demographics | Slides 13 to 29 |
| Optional Forms of Annuity Payments | Slides 30 to 31 |
| Classes T-C \& T-D Option 4: |  |
| Refund of Accumulated Deduction |  |
| Economic Assumptions | Slide 32 |
| - Rate of Investment Return | $7.25 \%$ |
| - Salary Scale | $5.00 \%$ |
| - Inflation | (30-year career average for member hired at age 30) |
| Actuarial Cost Method | $2.75 \%$ |

## Assumption Setting

- Actuary advises Board on adequacy of assumptions
- Experience study
- Judgment about future
- Board sets assumptions based on information provided


## Comparison of Projected System Funded Ratio

 (Based on Actuarial Value of Assets)| Fiscal Year Ending | Current Assumptions | Recommended Assumptions |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2015 | $60.6 \%$ | $60.6 \%$ |
| 2016 | $57.8 \%$ | $57.3 \%$ |
| 2017 | $55.9 \%$ | $55.6 \%$ |
| 2018 | $54.7 \%$ | $54.5 \%$ |
| 2019 | $56.8 \%$ | $55.3 \%$ |
| 2020 | $57.7 \%$ | $56.2 \%$ |

Note: Assumes a Fiscal Year 2016 Investment Return of $-1.00 \%$ and the assumed investment return thereafter.

Comparison of Projected System Unfunded Accrued Liability (Based on Actuarial Value of Assets)

| Fiscal Year Ending | Current Assumptions <br> (\$ millions) | Recommended Assumptions <br> (\$ millions) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2015 | $\$ 37,335.8$ | $\$ 37,335.8$ |
| 2016 | 41.034 .3 | $42,587.2$ |
| 2017 | $44,063.5$ | $45,487.1$ |
| 2018 | $46,515.9$ | $47,765.9$ |
| 2019 | $45,524.3$ | $48,054.0$ |
| 2020 | $45,647.3$ | $48,260.9$ |

[^0]
## Comparison of Projected System Appropriation Payroll

| Fiscal Year Ending | Current Assumptions <br> (\$ millions) | Recommended Assumptions <br> (\$ millions) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2017 | $\$ 13,549.0$ | $\$ 13,549.0$ |
| 2018 | $13,658.0$ | $13,688.4$ |
| 2019 | $14,012.7$ | $13,934.4$ |
| 2020 | $14,385.4$ | $14,204.8$ |
| 2021 | $14,775.5$ | $14,496.3$ |
| 2022 | $15,181.7$ | $14,806.8$ |

Note: Assumes a 3.50\% annual payroll growth.

## Comparison of Projected System Employer Contribution Rates

| Fiscal Year Ending | Current Assumptions | Recommended Assumptions |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2017 | $30.03 \%$ | $30.03 \%$ |
| 2018 | $32.26 \%$ | $32.25 \%$ |
| 2019 | $33.72 \%$ | $33.76 \%$ |
| 2020 | $34.90 \%$ | $35.07 \%$ |
| 2021 | $34.46 \%$ | $35.43 \%$ |
| 2022 | $34.72 \%$ | $35.58 \%$ |

Note: Assumes a Fiscal Year 2016 Investment Return of $-1.00 \%$ and the assumed investment return thereafter.

## Comparison of Total Projected System Employer Contributions

| Fiscal Year Ending | Current Assumptions <br> (\$ millions) | Recommended Assumptions <br> (\$ millions) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2017 | $\$ 4,068.8$ | $\$ 4,068.8$ |
| 2018 | $4,406.1$ | $4,414.5$ |
| 2019 | $4,725.1$ | $4,704.3$ |
| 2020 | $5,020.5$ | $4,981.6$ |
| 2021 | $5,091.6$ | $5,136.0$ |
| 2022 | $5,271.1$ | $5,312.7$ |
| Total | $\$ 28,583.2$ | $\$ 28,617.9$ |

Note: Assumes a Fiscal Year 2016 Investment Return of $-1.00 \%$ and the assumed investment return thereafter.

## Appendix

Appendix I
Current Assumptions - Projection of Contribution Rates and Funded Ratios As
of June 30, 2015

|  |  |  |  |  |  | Class T-E \& Share | $\begin{aligned} & \text { F Members } \\ & \text { d Risk } \end{aligned}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Fiscal Year Ending June | Appropriation Payroll (thousands) | Fiscal Year Market Rate of Return | Pension Rate Floor | $\qquad$ | Employer Normal Cost | Appropriation Payroll (\$1,000) | Additional Member Contribution | Employer Unfunded Liability Rate | Preliminary Employer Pension Rate | $\begin{gathered} \text { Health } \\ \text { Care } \\ \text { Contribution } \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Total Employer Contribution Rate | Employer Contribution (thousands) | Funded Ratio | Unfunded Accrued Liability (\$ Millions) |
| 2014 | \$ 13,720,000 | 14.91 \% | 4.00 \% | 7.43 \% | 8.57 \% |  |  | 15.25 \% | 23.82 \% | 0.93 \% | 16.93 \% |  | 62.0 \% | \$ 35,121.2 |
| 2015 | 13,482,000 | 3.04 | 4.00 | 7.46 | 8.46 |  |  | 17.51 | 25.97 | 0.90 | 21.40 |  | 60.6 | 37,335.8 |
| 2016 | 13,375,000 | 7.50 | 4.00 | 7.49 | 8.38 | \$ 1,005,828 | 0.00 \% | 19.44 | 27.82 | 0.84 | 25.84 | \$ 3,456,100 | 58.2 | 40,620.5 |
| 2017 | 13,549,000 | 7.50 | 8.31 | 7.52 | 8.31 | 1,374,901 | 0.00 | 20.89 | 29.20 | 0.83 | 30.03 | 4,068,765 | 56.8 | 43,159.9 |
| 2018 | 13,658,010 | 7.50 | 8.14 | 7.52 | 8.14 | 1,823,970 | 0.00 | 23.07 | 31.21 | 0.83 | 32.04 | 4,376,026 | 56.1 | 45,087.7 |
| 2019 | 14,012,675 | 7.50 | 7.98 | 7.52 | 7.98 | 2,264,456 | 0.00 | 24.47 | 32.45 | 0.82 | 33.27 | 4,662,017 | 58.6 | 43,551.4 |
| 2020 | 14,385,408 | 7.50 | 7.81 | 7.53 | 7.81 | 2,722,793 | 0.00 | 25.59 | 33.40 | 0.80 | 34.20 | 4,919,810 | 60.1 | 43,104.1 |
| 2021 | 14,775,522 | 7.50 | 7.66 | 7.53 | 7.66 | 3,201,938 | 0.00 | 25.06 | 32.72 | 0.79 | 33.51 | 4,951,277 | 61.2 | 43,070.0 |
| 2022 | 15,181,732 | 7.50 | 7.51 | 7.53 | 7.51 | 3,697,930 | 0.00 | 25.23 | 32.74 | 0.77 | 33.51 | 5,087,398 | 62.6 | 42,587.3 |
| 2023 | 15,592,952 | 7.50 | 7.36 | 7.53 | 7.36 | 4,207,780 | 0.00 | 25.63 | 32.99 | 0.76 | 33.75 | 5,262,621 | 64.1 | 41,893.2 |
| 2024 | 16,006,876 | 7.50 | 7.21 | 7.53 | 7.21 | 4,736,971 | 0.00 | 25.89 | 33.10 | 0.74 | 33.84 | 5,416,727 | 65.5 | 41,290.2 |
| 2025 | 16,425,303 | 7.50 | 7.06 | 7.53 | 7.06 | 5,293,556 | 0.00 | 26.16 | 33.22 | 0.72 | 33.94 | 5,574,748 | 67.3 | 40,199.8 |
| 2026 | 16,849,867 | 7.50 | 6.90 | 7.53 | 6.90 | 5,881,838 | 0.00 | 26.56 | 33.46 | 0.72 | 34.18 | 5,759,285 | 69.2 | 38,808.0 |
| 2027 | 17,269,991 | 7.50 | 6.74 | 7.53 | 6.74 | 6,500,569 | 0.00 | 26.87 | 33.61 | 0.69 | 34.30 | 5,923,607 | 71.2 | 37,123.3 |
| 2028 | 17,684,009 | 7.50 | 6.56 | 7.54 | 6.56 | 7,151,591 | 0.00 | 27.19 | 33.75 | 0.69 | 34.44 | 6,090,373 | 73.4 | 35,136.3 |
| 2029 | 18,092,525 | 7.50 | 6.40 | 7.54 | 6.40 | 7,833,482 | 0.00 | 27.52 | 33.92 | 0.69 | 34.61 | 6,261,823 | 75.7 | 32,832.9 |
| 2030 | 18,496,390 | 7.50 | 6.22 | 7.54 | 6.22 | 8,546,305 | 0.00 | 27.88 | 34.10 | 0.69 | 34.79 | 6,434,894 | 78.2 | 30,172.9 |
| 2031 | 18,901,232 | 7.50 | 6.04 | 7.54 | 6.04 | 9,295,343 | 0.00 | 28.25 | 34.29 | 0.69 | 34.98 | 6,611,651 | 80.8 | 27,122.1 |
| 2032 | 19,306,605 | 7.50 | 5.86 | 7.54 | 5.86 | 10,081,131 | 0.00 | 28.64 | 34.50 | 0.69 | 35.19 | 6,793,994 | 83.6 | 23,647.6 |
| 2033 | 19,711,447 | 7.50 | 5.67 | 7.54 | 5.67 | 10,904,526 | 0.00 | 29.04 | 34.71 | 0.69 | 35.40 | 6,977,852 | 86.6 | 19,712.1 |
| 2034 | 20,119,213 | 7.50 | 5.48 | 7.54 | 5.48 | 11,766,018 | 0.00 | 29.46 | 34.94 | 0.69 | 35.63 | 7,168,476 | 89.8 | 15,274.8 |
| 2035 | 20,534,465 | 7.50 | 5.28 | 7.54 | 5.28 | 12,664,404 | 0.00 | 29.88 | 35.16 | 0.69 | 35.85 | 7,361,606 | 93.3 | 10,293.8 |
| 2036 | 20,959,917 | 7.50 | 5.08 | 7.54 | 5.08 | 13,599,604 | 0.00 | 14.66 | 19.74 | 0.69 | 20.43 | 4,282,111 | 94.9 | 8,000.0 |
| 2037 | 21,392,675 | 7.50 | 4.87 | 7.54 | 4.87 | 14,573,742 | 0.00 | 10.91 | 15.78 | 0.69 | 16.47 | 3,523,374 | 96.1 | 6,272.1 |
| 2038 | 21,836,128 | 7.50 | 4.67 | 7.54 | 4.67 | 15,585,801 | 0.00 | 9.28 | 13.95 | 0.69 | 14.64 | 3,196,809 | 97.1 | 4,721.2 |
| 2039 | 22,293,310 | 7.50 | 4.46 | 7.54 | 4.46 | 16,630,158 | 0.00 | 7.41 | 11.87 | 0.69 | 12.56 | 2,800,040 | 97.9 | 3,426.6 |
| 2040 | 22,765,638 | 7.50 | 4.26 | 7.54 | 4.26 | 17,705,497 | 0.00 | 5.95 | 10.21 | 0.69 | 10.90 | 2,481,455 | 98.6 | 2,332.7 |
| 2041 | 23,256,592 | 7.50 | 4.05 | 7.54 | 4.05 | 18,809,555 | 0.00 | 4.65 | 8.70 | 0.69 | 9.39 | 2,183,794 | 99.2 | 1,427.6 |
| 2042 | 23,771,462 | 7.50 | 3.86 | 7.54 | 3.86 | 19,942,765 | 0.00 | 2.58 | 6.44 | 0.69 | 7.13 | 1,694,905 | 99.5 | 922.8 |
| 2043 | 24,320,134 | 7.50 | 3.67 | 7.54 | 3.67 | 21,106,223 | 0.00 | 1.04 | 4.71 | 0.69 | 5.40 | 1,313,287 | 99.6 | 740.0 |
| 2044 | 24,918,450 | 7.50 | 3.50 | 7.54 | 3.50 | 22,293,611 | 0.00 | (0.16) | 3.34 | 0.69 | 4.19 | 1,044,083 | 99.6 | 795.6 |
| 2045 | 25,575,198 | 7.50 | 3.34 | 7.54 | 3.34 | 23,498,506 | 0.00 | 0.79 | 4.13 | 0.69 | 4.82 | 1,232,725 | 99.6 | 653.2 |
| 2046 | 26,301,180 | 7.50 | 3.22 | 7.53 | 3.22 | 24,710,239 | 0.00 | 0.81 | 4.03 | 0.69 | 4.72 | 1,241,416 | 99.7 | 490.4 |
| 2047 | 27,097,844 | 7.50 | 3.11 | 7.53 | 3.11 | 25,915,936 | 0.00 | 0.55 | 3.66 | 0.69 | 4.35 | 1,178,756 | 99.8 | 379.5 |
| 2048 | 27,966,454 | 7.50 | 3.02 | 7.53 | 3.02 | 27,118,327 | 0.00 | 0.48 | 3.50 | 0.69 | 4.19 | 1,171,794 | 99.9 | 274.2 |
| 2049 | 28,911,941 | 7.50 | 2.97 | 7.52 | 2.97 | 28,304,513 | 0.00 | 0.42 | 3.39 | 0.69 | 4.08 | 1,179,607 | 99.9 | 174.0 |

Note: Assumes an investment return of 7.50\% per year for fiscal year 2016 and thereafter.

## Appendix II

Recommended Assumptions - Projection of Contrilbution Rates and Funded
Ratios As of June 30, 2015

|  |  |  |  |  |  | Class T-E \& Share | F Members Risk |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Fiscal Year Ending June | Appropriation Payroll (thousands) | Fiscal Year Market Rate of Return | Pension Rate Floor | $\qquad$ | Employer Normal Cost | Appropriation Payroll $(\$ 1,000)$ | Additional Member Contribution | Employer Unfunded Liability Rate | Preliminary Employer Pension Rate | $\begin{gathered} \text { Health } \\ \text { Care } \\ \text { Contribution } \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\qquad$ | Projected Total <br> Employer <br> Contribution <br> (thousands) | $\begin{gathered} \text { Fundd } \\ \text { Ratio } \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Unfunded } \\ & \text { Accrued } \\ & \text { Liability } \\ & \text { (\$ Millions) } \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ |
| 2014 | \$ 13,720,000 | 14.91 \% | 4.00 \% | 7.43 \% | 8.57 \% |  |  | 15.25 \% | 23.82 \% | 0.93 \% | 16.93 \% |  | 62.0 \% | \$ 35,121.2 |
| 2015 | 13,482,000 | 3.04 | 4.00 | 7.46 | 8.46 |  |  | 17.51 | 25.97 | 0.90 | 21.40 |  | 60.6 | 37,335.8 |
| 2016 | 13,375,000 | 7.50 | 4.00 | 7.49 | 8.38 | \$ 1,005,828 | 0.00 \% | 19.44 | 27.82 | 0.84 | 25.84 | \$ 3,456,100 | 57.7 | 42,173.4 |
| 2017 | 13,549,000 | 7.25 | 8.31 | 7.52 | 8.31 | 1,405,215 | 0.00 | 20.89 | 29.20 | 0.83 | 30.03 | 4,068,765 | 56.5 | 44,585.4 |
| 2018 | 13,688,437 | 7.25 | 7.89 | 7.52 | 7.89 | 1,895,542 | 0.00 | 23.28 | 31.17 | 0.87 | 32.04 | 4,385,775 | 55.9 | 46,343.2 |
| 2019 | 13,934,438 | 7.25 | 7.70 | 7.53 | 7.70 | 2,379,048 | 0.00 | 24.77 | 32.47 | 0.85 | 33.32 | 4,642,955 | 57.2 | 46,092.3 |
| 2020 | 14,204,767 | 7.25 | 7.54 | 7.53 | 7.54 | 2,867,374 | 0.00 | 25.99 | 33.53 | 0.85 | 34.38 | 4,883,599 | 58.5 | 45,736.4 |
| 2021 | 14,496,287 | 7.25 | 7.38 | 7.53 | 7.38 | 3,365,547 | 0.00 | 26.28 | 33.66 | 0.83 | 34.49 | 4,999,769 | 59.5 | 45,706.2 |
| 2022 | 14,806,779 | 7.25 | 7.23 | 7.53 | 7.23 | 3,869,197 | 0.00 | 26.63 | 33.86 | 0.82 | 34.68 | 5,134,991 | 60.9 | 45,223.1 |
| 2023 | 15,122,330 | 7.25 | 7.08 | 7.53 | 7.08 | 4,374,200 | 0.00 | 27.20 | 34.28 | 0.82 | 35.10 | 5,307,938 | 62.4 | 44,525.8 |
| 2024 | 15,438,999 | 7.25 | 6.93 | 7.53 | 6.93 | 4,887,620 | 0.00 | 27.64 | 34.57 | 0.79 | 35.36 | 5,459,230 | 63.8 | 43,915.9 |
| 2025 | 15,761,322 | 7.25 | 6.78 | 7.53 | 6.78 | 5,418,834 | 0.00 | 28.09 | 34.87 | 0.79 | 35.66 | 5,620,487 | 65.5 | 42,814.3 |
| 2026 | 16,086,877 | 7.25 | 6.63 | 7.53 | 6.63 | 5,973,263 | 0.00 | 28.67 | 35.30 | 0.77 | 36.07 | 5,802,537 | 67.3 | 41,407.8 |
| 2027 | 16,405,965 | 7.25 | 6.47 | 7.54 | 6.47 | 6,547,676 | 0.00 | 29.16 | 35.63 | 0.76 | 36.39 | 5,970,131 | 69.4 | 39,698.0 |
| 2028 | 16,715,494 | 7.25 | 6.31 | 7.54 | 6.31 | 7,145,548 | 0.00 | 29.66 | 35.97 | 0.76 | 36.73 | 6,139,601 | 71.6 | 37,672.9 |
| 2029 | 17,018,546 | 7.25 | 6.15 | 7.54 | 6.15 | 7,764,715 | 0.00 | 30.18 | 36.33 | 0.76 | 37.09 | 6,312,179 | 73.9 | 35,316.4 |
| 2030 | 17,318,529 | 7.25 | 5.99 | 7.54 | 5.99 | 8,399,842 | 0.00 | 30.72 | 36.71 | 0.76 | 37.47 | 6,489,253 | 76.4 | 32,597.5 |
| 2031 | 17,615,863 | 7.25 | 5.83 | 7.54 | 5.83 | 9,060,873 | 0.00 | 31.28 | 37.11 | 0.76 | 37.87 | 6,671,127 | 79.1 | 29,482.9 |
| 2032 | 17,911,105 | 7.25 | 5.66 | 7.54 | 5.66 | 9,747,554 | 0.00 | 31.85 | 37.51 | 0.76 | 38.27 | 6,854,580 | 82.0 | 25,940.5 |
| 2033 | 18,205,473 | 7.25 | 5.49 | 7.54 | 5.49 | 10,461,478 | 0.00 | 32.45 | 37.94 | 0.76 | 38.70 | 7,045,518 | 85.1 | 21,933.2 |
| 2034 | 18,498,779 | 7.25 | 5.31 | 7.54 | 5.31 | 11,202,296 | 0.00 | 33.06 | 38.37 | 0.76 | 39.13 | 7,238,572 | 88.3 | 17,421.4 |
| 2035 | 18,792,074 | 7.25 | 5.13 | 7.54 | 5.13 | 11,970,215 | 0.00 | 33.69 | 38.82 | 0.76 | 39.58 | 7,437,903 | 91.9 | 12,364.1 |
| 2036 | 19,091,455 | 7.25 | 4.95 | 7.54 | 4.95 | 12,762,479 | 0.00 | 17.54 | 22.49 | 0.76 | 23.25 | 4,438,763 | 93.6 | 9,920.9 |
| 2037 | 19,395,580 | 7.25 | 4.77 | 7.54 | 4.77 | 13,580,158 | 0.00 | 13.60 | 18.37 | 0.76 | 19.13 | 3,710,374 | 94.9 | 8,008.8 |
| 2038 | 19,709,906 | 7.25 | 4.58 | 7.54 | 4.58 | 14,420,653 | 0.00 | 11.92 | 16.50 | 0.76 | 17.26 | 3,401,930 | 96.1 | 6,244.3 |
| 2039 | 20,032,714 | 7.25 | 4.40 | 7.54 | 4.40 | 15,280,785 | 0.00 | 9.98 | 14.38 | 0.76 | 15.14 | 3,032,953 | 97.1 | 4,702.0 |
| 2040 | 20,367,773 | 7.25 | 4.22 | 7.54 | 4.22 | 16,157,658 | 0.00 | 8.45 | 12.67 | 0.76 | 13.43 | 2,735,392 | 98.0 | 3,324.3 |
| 2041 | 20,717,690 | 7.25 | 4.04 | 7.54 | 4.04 | 17,049,353 | 0.00 | 7.10 | 11.14 | 0.76 | 11.90 | 2,465,405 | 98.7 | 2,096.0 |
| 2042 | 21,085,759 | 7.25 | 3.87 | 7.54 | 3.87 | 17,957,241 | 0.00 | 3.71 | 7.58 | 0.76 | 8.34 | 1,758,552 | 99.1 | 1,467.8 |
| 2043 | 21,481,086 | 7.25 | 3.71 | 7.54 | 3.71 | 18,881,484 | 0.00 | 2.14 | 5.85 | 0.76 | 6.61 | 1,419,900 | 99.4 | 1,115.4 |
| 2044 | 21,912,963 | 7.25 | 3.55 | 7.54 | 3.55 | 19,818,137 | 0.00 | 0.92 | 4.47 | 0.76 | 5.23 | 1,146,048 | 99.4 | 994.7 |
| 2045 | 22,392,322 | 7.25 | 3.43 | 7.53 | 3.43 | 20,759,532 | 0.00 | 1.05 | 4.48 | 0.76 | 5.24 | 1,173,358 | 99.5 | 832.3 |
| 2046 | 22,925,266 | 7.25 | 3.32 | 7.53 | 3.32 | 21,695,417 | 0.00 | 1.07 | 4.39 | 0.76 | 5.15 | 1,180,651 | 99.6 | 648.8 |
| 2047 | 23,509,443 | 7.25 | 3.23 | 7.53 | 3.23 | 22,612,743 | 0.00 | 0.76 | 3.99 | 0.76 | 4.75 | 1,116,699 | 99.7 | 517.4 |
| 2048 | 24,145,251 | 7.25 | 3.17 | 7.52 | 3.17 | 23,517,223 | 0.00 | 0.67 | 3.84 | 0.76 | 4.60 | 1,110,682 | 99.8 | 393.1 |
| 2049 | 24,837,653 | 7.25 | 3.12 | 7.52 | 3.12 | 24,402,768 | 0.00 | 0.59 | 3.71 | 0.76 | 4.47 | 1,110,243 | 99.9 | 276.0 |

Note: Assumes an investment return of 7.50\% for fiscal year 2016 and $7.25 \%$ per year thereafter.


## Appendix IV

Comparison of Projected System Employer Contribution Rates


## Appendix V <br> Comparison of Projected System Appropriation Payroll (Millions)



Note: Assumes a 3.50\% annual payroll growth.

## Appendix VI

Comparison of Projected System Funded Ratio (Based on Actuarial Value of Assets)


## Appendix VII

Comparison of Projected System Unfunded Accrued Liability (Based on Actuarial Value of Assets and in Millions)



[^0]:    Note: Assumes a Fiscal Year 2016 Investment Return of $-1.00 \%$ and the assumed investment return thereafter.

